

6055 Rockside Woods Boulevard, Suite 350  
Independence, OH 44131

Phone: 216-606-1300  
Fax: 216-606-1350



August 24, 2015

**Confidential**

Mr. Timothy Tigue  
Superintendent  
The City of North Royalton  
11675 Royalton Road  
North Royalton, Ohio 44133

147618

Re: Bid Evaluation and Recommendation  
North Royalton Treatment Plant Standby Generator Replacement

Dear Mr. Tigue:

The City of North Royalton received two (2) sealed bids for the above referenced project on August 20, 2015 which was opened and read publicly. A summary of the bids received is as follows:

Bid Summary	
Bidder	Apparent Total Bid
Bay Mechanical and Electrical Corp. (Bay Mechanical)	\$281,050.00
CMM, Inc.	\$278,775.20

CMM, Inc.'s bid is approximately 0.8% below Bay Mechanical's bid and both are below the Engineer's Estimate of \$306,954.

The apparent low bid from CMM, Inc. was not accompanied by a bid bond. Per the Ohio Revised Code section 153.08 and Article 7 in the Bid Form, a bid shall be invalid and not considered unless a bid guaranty is filed with the bid.

Based on the above findings, we recommend not awarding the contract to CMM, Inc.

Brown and Caldwell also evaluated the entire bid package from Bay Mechanical. A summary of the bid package review is provided below.

**Bid Submittal**

Bay Mechanical submitted their bid on the forms provided.

**Acknowledgement of Addendum**

Bay Mechanical acknowledged receiving Addendum 1.

**Signatures**

Bay Mechanical signed all bid forms as required

**Listing of Proposed Subcontractors**

Mr. Timothy Tigue  
Superintendent  
The City of North Royalton  
11675 Royalton Road  
North Royalton, Ohio 44133  
Page 2

Bay Mechanical listed all 3 approved generator suppliers as the generator manufacturer to be used.

**Bid Bond**

Bay Mechanical submitted a bid bond

**Contractor's License Number**

Bay Mechanical provided their contractor's license number.

**Evidence of Authority**

Bay Mechanical provided evidence of authority for individuals signing the bid documents.

**Bidders Qualifications Questionnaire**

Bay Mechanical completed the bidders qualification questionnaire. Bay Mechanical states an audited balance sheet (requested in Article 10) would be provided if they are the low bidder. **BC suggests requesting the balance sheet from Bay Mechanical.**

**Resumes**

Bay Mechanical provided resumes for their H&S officer and key project individuals.

**Non-Collusion Affidavit**

Bay Mechanical did not provide a Non-Collusion Affidavit. **BC suggests requesting the document from Bay Mechanical.**

**Personal Property Tax Affidavit**

Bay Mechanical did not provide a Personal Property Tax Affidavit. **BC suggests requesting the document from Bay Mechanical.**

**Recommendation**

Based on our review of the bid packages that was submitted, CMM, Inc's Bid (the apparent low bidder) does not conform to the requirements and Bay Mechanical's bid generally conforms to the requirements stated in the Contract Documents. Brown and Caldwell recommends awarding North Royalton Standby Generator Replacement Contract to Bay Mechanical. However, we recommend the City of North Royalton request the information identified above prior to awarding the contract.

Very truly yours,

**Brown and Caldwell**



Tiffany Ashforth, Project Manager