KEM
K.E. McCartney & Associates, Inc.
Engineers · Planners · Surveyors

July 16, 2015

Mark A. Schmitzer, P.E.
North Royalton City Engineer
11545 Royalton Road
North Royalton, Ohio 44133

RE: 2015 Pavement Rehabilitation
Bid Tabulation

Dear Mr. Schmitzer:

Bids were received and publicly read on July 15, 2015 at the City of North Royalton Municipal Building for the above referenced project. There were six (6) contractors that submitted bids for the project. The bids were reviewed for mathematical accuracy. The bid tabulation is attached and is summarized as follows:

Contractor	As Read	Corrected
Karvo Paving Co.	$1,175,078.34	-
Crossroads Asphalt Recycling	$1,219,065.12	-
Shelly Company	$1,220,189.40	-
Chagrin Valley Paving	$1,227,519.90	-
Specialized Construction	$1,361,672.64	-
Burton Scott Contractors	$1,366,519.50	$1,366,519.14

The low bidder was 5.74% below the Engineer's estimate of $1,246,687. The low bidder is ODOT prequalified to perform this type of work.

As a result of the review, it is recommended to accept the bid and award the project to Karvo Paving Company, 4524 Hudson Drive, Stow, Ohio 44224 in the amount of $1,175,078.34 contingent upon your review and approval of the Bid Forms.

If there are any questions, or further information is required, please contact this office at 419-525-0093.

K.E. McCartney & Associates, Inc.

James D. Mawhorr

James D. Mawhorr, P.E., P.S.
Senior Vice President

Z:\HY\HY-228 North Royalton Pavement\Admin\Docs\Bid Tabulation Summary Cover Letter M.Schmitzer 7-16-15.docx

52 N. Diamond St. • Mansfield, OH 44902 • T. 419.525.0093 • F. 419.525.0635
526 E. Broad St. • Elyria, OH 44035 • T. 440.323.9608 • F. 440.323.3644
Brian P. McCartney, P.E., P.S. • Kenneth A. McCartney, P.S. • James D. Mawhorr, P.E., P.S.

KEM Quality since 1978
www.kemccartney.com

2015 PAVEMENT REHABILITATION - NORTH ROYALTON, OHIO
BID TAB SUMMARY - BID OPENING DATE: JULY 15, 2015
PREPARED BY: K.E. MCCARTNEY & ASSOCIATES, INC.

ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		KARVO PAVING COMPANY		CROSSROADS ASPHALT RECYCLING		SHELLY COMPANY		CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING		SPECIALIZED CONSTRUCTION		BURTON SCOT CONTRACTORS	
				UNIT PRICE	COST	UNIT PRICE	COST	UNIT PRICE	COST	UNIT PRICE	COST	UNIT PRICE	COST	UNIT PRICE	COST	UNIT PRICE	COST
1	204 - EXCAVATION OF SUBGRADE	50	CY	$ 25.00	$ 1,250.00	$ 25.00	$ 1,250.00	$ 40.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 50.00	$ 2,500.00	$ 20.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 10.00	$ 500.00	$ 40.00	$ 2,000.00
2	204 - GRANULAR MATERIAL, TYPE B (304 LIMESTONE)	50	CY	$ 50.00	$ 2,500.00	$ 55.00	$ 2,750.00	$ 50.00	$ 2,500.00	$ 70.00	$ 3,500.00	$ 55.00	$ 2,750.00	$ 40.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 60.00	$ 3,000.00
3	251 - PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR	128	CY	$ 250.00	$ 32,000.00	$ 460.00	$ 58,880.00	$ 511.00	$ 65,408.00	$ 550.00	$ 70,400.00	$ 300.00	$ 38,400.00	$ 500.00	$ 64,000.00	$ 685.00	$ 87,680.00
4	252 - FULL DEPTH RIGID REMOVAL AND FLEXIBLE REPLACEMENT	254	CY	$ 300.00	$ 76,200.00	$ 200.00	$ 50,800.00	$ 265.00	$ 67,310.00	$ 185.00	$ 46,990.00	$ 210.00	$ 53,340.00	$ 400.00	$ 101,600.00	$ 385.00	$ 97,790.00
5	253 - PAVEMENT REPAIR	17	CY	$ 250.00	$ 4,250.00	$ 400.00	$ 6,800.00	$ 285.00	$ 4,845.00	$ 350.00	$ 5,950.00	$ 370.00	$ 6,290.00	$ 250.00	$ 4,250.00	$ 500.00	$ 8,500.00
6	254 - PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	8850	SY	$ 3.00	$ 26,550.00	$ 3.00	$ 26,550.00	$ 3.50	$ 30,975.00	$ 3.50	$ 30,975.00	$ 3.10	$ 27,435.00	$ 5.00	$ 44,250.00	$ 4.50	$ 39,825.00
7	254 - PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE	18950	SY	$ 3.00	$ 56,850.00	$ 2.00	$ 37,900.00	$ 2.00	$ 37,900.00	$ 2.80	$ 53,060.00	$ 3.80	$ 72,010.00	$ 4.00	$ 75,800.00	$ 3.50	$ 66,325.00
8	SPECIAL - HYBRID INTERLAY PAVING MAT, GLASPAVE 50	17350	SY	$ 6.00	$ 104,100.00	$ 5.85	$ 101,497.50	$ 5.77	$ 100,109.50	$ 6.00	$ 104,100.00	$ 5.80	$ 100,630.00	$ 6.00	$ 104,100.00	$ 5.75	$ 99,762.50
9	SPECIAL - COLD IN-PLACE RECYCLING OF ASPHALT AND BASE	12250	SY	$ 7.50	$ 91,875.00	$ 3.72	$ 45,570.00	$ 5.25	$ 64,312.50	$ 4.50	$ 55,125.00	$ 5.35	$ 65,537.50	$ 7.50	$ 91,875.00	$ 4.00	$ 49,000.00
10	407 - TACK COAT	3360	GAL	$ 3.00	$ 10,080.00	$ 1.95	$ 6,552.00	$ 2.00	$ 6,720.00	$ 2.00	$ 6,720.00	$ 2.00	$ 6,720.00	$ 2.00	$ 6,720.00	$ 1.85	$ 6,216.00
11	448 - ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, PG64-22	1526	CY	$ 180.00	$ 274,680.00	$ 174.00	$ 265,524.00	$ 178.00	$ 271,628.00	$ 167.00	$ 254,842.00	$ 167.00	$ 254,842.00	$ 200.00	$ 305,200.00	$ 205.00	$ 312,830.00
12	448 - ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, PG64-22	1508	CY	$ 160.00	$ 241,280.00	$ 128.00	$ 193,024.00	$ 132.00	$ 199,056.00	$ 120.00	$ 180,960.00	$ 125.00	$ 188,500.00	$ 175.00	$ 263,900.00	$ 163.00	$ 245,804.00
13	608 - CURB RAMP	8	EA	$ 1,000.00	$ 8,000.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 8,000.00	$ 945.00	$ 7,560.00	$ 1,100.00	$ 8,800.00	$ 975.00	$ 7,800.00	$ 400.00	$ 3,200.00	$ 950.00	$ 7,600.00
14	609 - CURB, AS PER PLAN	620	FT	$ 40.00	$ 24,800.00	$ 30.00	$ 18,600.00	$ 48.60	$ 30,132.00	$ 36.00	$ 22,320.00	$ 50.00	$ 31,000.00	$ 40.00	$ 24,800.00	$ 50.00	$ 31,000.00
15	611 - CATCH BASIN ADJUSTED TO GRADE	48	EA	$ 500.00	$ 24,000.00	$ 725.00	$ 34,800.00	$ 700.00	$ 33,600.00	$ 550.00	$ 26,400.00	$ 750.00	$ 36,000.00	$ 350.00	$ 16,800.00	$ 500.00	$ 24,000.00
16	611 - INLET ADJUSTED TO GRADE	18	EA	$ 500.00	$ 9,000.00	$ 750.00	$ 13,500.00	$ 700.00	$ 12,600.00	$ 700.00	$ 12,600.00	$ 750.00	$ 13,500.00	$ 350.00	$ 6,300.00	$ 600.00	$ 10,800.00
17	611 - MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	25	EA	$ 500.00	$ 12,500.00	$ 775.00	$ 19,375.00	$ 475.00	$ 11,875.00	$ 650.00	$ 16,250.00	$ 550.00	$ 13,750.00	$ 350.00	$ 8,750.00	$ 650.00	$ 16,250.00
18	611 - MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	27	EA	$ 300.00	$ 8,100.00	$ 450.00	$ 12,150.00	$ 400.00	$ 10,800.00	$ 450.00	$ 12,150.00	$ 475.00	$ 12,825.00	$ 100.00	$ 2,700.00	$ 500.00	$ 13,500.00
19	611 - SPECIAL - MISCELLANEOUS METALS	5000	LBS	$ 1.20	$ 6,000.00	$ 1.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 1.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 1.75	$ 8,750.00	$ 1.70	$ 8,500.00	$ 1.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 1.60	$ 8,000.00
20	638 - VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	4	EA	$ 300.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 400.00	$ 1,600.00	$ 250.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 375.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 475.00	$ 1,900.00	$ 100.00	$ 400.00	$ 500.00	$ 2,000.00
21	642 - CENTER LINE	1.47	MI	$ 6,000.00	$ 8,820.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,470.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,470.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,470.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,470.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,470.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,470.00
22	642 - EDGE LINE	1.67	MI	$ 4,000.00	$ 6,680.00	$ 650.00	$ 1,085.50	$ 650.00	$ 1,085.50	$ 650.00	$ 1,085.50	$ 650.00	$ 1,085.50	$ 650.00	$ 1,085.50	$ 650.00	$ 1,085.50
23	642 - STOP LINE	95	FT	$ 10.00	$ 950.00	$ 3.00	$ 285.00	$ 3.00	$ 285.00	$ 3.00	$ 285.00	$ 3.00	$ 285.00	$ 3.00	$ 285.00	$ 3.00	$ 285.00
24	642 - CROSSWALK LINE	310	FT	$ 5.00	$ 1,550.00	$ 2.25	$ 697.50	$ 2.25	$ 697.50	$ 2.25	$ 697.50	$ 2.25	$ 697.50	$ 2.25	$ 697.50	$ 2.25	$ 697.50
25	614 - ASPHALT CONCRETE FOR MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	20	CY	$ 300.00	$ 6,000.00	$ 175.00	$ 3,500.00	$ 185.00	$ 3,700.00	$ 275.00	$ 5,500.00	$ 75.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 150.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 200.00	$ 4,000.00
26	614 - MAINTAINING TRAFFIC	1	LS	$ 25,000.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 40,000.00	$ 40,000.00	$ 54,440.00	$ 54,440.00	$ 90,000.00	$ 90,000.00	$ 67,500.00	$ 67,500.00	$ 39,000.00	$ 39,000.00	$ 36,000.00	$ 36,000.00
27	624 - MOBILIZATION	1	LS	$ 25,000.00	$ 25,000.00	$ 80,000.00	$ 80,000.00	$ 52,105.00	$ 52,105.00	$ 51,000.00	$ 51,000.00	$ 75,000.00	$ 75,000.00	$ 29,000.00	$ 29,000.00	$ 40,000.00	$ 40,000.00
28	SPECIAL - PRECONSTRUCTION PHOTOGRAPHY	1	LS	$ 5,000.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 2,200.00	$ 2,200.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 1,600.00	$ 1,600.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 3,000.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00
29	SPECIAL - POSTCONSTRUCTION PHOTOGRAPHY	1	LS	$ 5,000.00	$ 5,000.00	$ 1,800.00	$ 1,800.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 1,600.00	$ 1,600.00	$ 500.00	$ 500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00
30	206 - CEMENT	375	TON	$ 147.00	$ 55,125.00	$ 125.00	$ 46,875.00	$ 126.00	$ 47,250.00	$ 125.00	$ 46,875.00	$ 115.00	$ 43,125.00	$ 135.00	$ 50,625.00	$ 125.00	$ 46,875.00
				TOTAL:	$ 1,154,340.00	TOTAL:	$ 1,088,035.50		$ 1,128,764.00		$ 1,129,805.00		$ 1,136,592.50		$ 1,260,808.00		$ 1,265,295.50
31	CONTINGENCY - 8% OF THE SUM OF LINE ITEMS 1 THRU 30	1	LS	$ 92,347.20	$ 92,347.20	$ 87,042.84	$ 87,042.84	$ 90,301.12	$ 90,301.12	$ 90,384.40	$ 90,384.40	$ 90,927.40	$ 90,927.40	$ 100,864.64	$ 100,864.64	$ 101,223.64	$ 101,223.64
				TOTAL:	***$ 1,246,687.20***	***TOTAL:***	***$ 1,175,078.34***	***TOTAL:***	***$ 1,219,065.12***	***TOTAL:***	***$ 1,220,189.40***	***TOTAL:***	***$ 1,227,519.90***	***TOTAL:***	***$ 1,361,672.64***	***TOTAL: ****	***$ 1,366,519.14***

* AS READ AMOUNT WAS $1,366,519.50 (CORRECTION WAS MADE TO LINE ITEM 31 - CONTINGENCY)